



U. S. CHEMICAL SAFETY AND HAZARD INVESTIGATION BOARD

INVESTIGATION REPORT

PROPANE TANK EXPLOSION (2 DEATHS, 7 INJURIES)



Herrig Brothers Feather Creek Farm
Albert City, Iowa
APRIL 9, 1998

KEY ISSUES:

- DESIGN & INSTALLATION DEFICIENCIES
- REGULATORY OVERSIGHT
- BLEVE HAZARD & EMERGENCY RESPONSE

Report No. 98-007-I-IA

Abstract: This report explains the explosion/BLEVE that took place on April 9, 1998, at the Herrig Brothers Feather Creek Farm, located in Albert City, Iowa. Two volunteer fire fighters were killed and seven other emergency response personnel were injured. Safety issues covered in the report include protection of propane storage tanks and piping, state regulatory oversight of such installations, and fire fighter response to propane storage tank fires. Recommendations concerning these issues were made to the Herrig Brothers Feather Creek Farm, the Iowa State Fire Marshal, the Fire Service Institute of Iowa State University, and the National Propane Gas Association.

The U.S. Chemical Safety and Hazard Investigation Board (CSB) is an independent federal agency whose mission is to ensure the safety of workers and the public by preventing or minimizing the effects of chemical incidents. The CSB is a scientific investigatory organization; it is not an enforcement or regulatory body. Established by the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990, the CSB is responsible for determining the probable causes of incidents, issuing safety recommendations, studying chemical safety issues, and evaluating the effectiveness of other government agencies involved with chemical safety. No part of the conclusions, findings, or recommendations of the CSB relating to any chemical incident may be admitted as evidence or used in any action or suit for damages arising out of any matter mentioned in an investigation report. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 7412(r)(6)(G). The CSB makes public its actions and decisions through investigation reports, summary reports, safety studies, safety recommendations, special technical publications, and statistical reviews. More information about the CSB may be found on the World Wide Web at (<http://www.chemsafety.gov>).

Information about CSB publications may be obtained by contacting the:

**U. S. Chemical Safety and Hazard Investigation Board
Office of External Relations
2175 K Street, N.W. - Suite 400
Washington, DC 20037
(202) 261-7600**

CSB publications may be purchased from the:

**National Technical Information Service
5285 Port Royal Road
Springfield, Virginia 22161
(703) 487- 4600**

Salus Populi Est Lex Suprema
People's Safety is the Highest Law

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
ES.1 INTRODUCTION.....	1
ES.2 INITIATING EVENT	1
ES.3 KEY FINDINGS	3
ES.4 RECOMMENDATIONS.....	5
1.0 INTRODUCTION.....	7
1.1 BACKGROUND	7
1.2 INVESTIGATION PROCESS	8
2.0 FARM OPERATION AND PROPANE SYSTEM	9
2.1 SYSTEM LAYOUT AND COMPONENTS.....	10
2.2 SYSTEM OPERATION.....	15
3.0 DESCRIPTION OF THE INCIDENT.....	16
3.1 PRE-INCIDENT EVENTS	16
3.2 EMERGENCY RESPONSE	17
3.3 BLEVE.....	20
3.3.1 <i>Nature of a BLEVE</i>	20
3.3.2 <i>Events Leading to the BLEVE at the Farm</i>	20
3.4 DISPERSAL OF TANK FRAGMENTS AND DAMAGE TO PROPERTY.....	22
3.4.1 <i>Dispersal of Tank Fragments</i>	22
3.4.2 <i>Damage to Property</i>	23
3.5 METEOROLOGICAL INFORMATION.....	25
4.0 ANALYSIS OF THE INCIDENT.....	26
4.1 DESIGN AND INSTALLATION DEFICIENCIES	26
4.1.1 <i>Lack of Protection from Vehicular Damage</i>	26
4.1.2 <i>Improper Size of Outlet Pipe from Excess Flow Valve FV3</i>	27
4.2 REGULATORY OVERSIGHT	29
4.2.1 <i>Overview</i>	29
4.2.2 <i>State Regulatory Oversight</i>	29
4.3 DAMAGE TO LIQUID LINE.....	31
4.4 ALBERT CITY VOLUNTEER FIRE DEPARTMENT TRAINING	32
4.4.1 <i>National Propane Gas Association Training Materials</i>	32
4.4.2 <i>Training By The Fire Service Institute, Iowa State University</i>	33
4.4.3 <i>Guidance on Propane Tank Fires in 1996 North American Emergency Response Guidebook</i>	34
4.5 ANALYSIS OF EMERGENCY RESPONSE	35
4.5.1 <i>The Time Factor in Responding to the Scene of a Potential BLEVE</i>	36
4.5.2 <i>Deployment of Personnel When Fighting a Propane Tank Fire</i>	36
4.6 ALTERNATIVE SCENARIO.....	37
4.7 ROOT AND CONTRIBUTING CAUSES.....	38
5.0 RECOMMENDATIONS	40
6.0 REFERENCES.....	42
APPENDIX A: METHODOLOGIES USED TO DETERMINE CAUSES.....	44
APPENDIX B: NASA ANALYSIS.....	47
APPENDIX C: DEBRIS MAP.....	61

TABLE OF FIGURES

FIGURE 1. AERIAL VIEW OF THE FARM ON APRIL 10, 1998	7
FIGURE 2. PLOT PLAN OF FARM, 2243 490TH STREET, ALBERT CITY, IOWA	10
FIGURE 3. THE 18,000-GALLON PROPANE TANK THAT EXPLODED.....	11
FIGURE 4. LIQUID LINE SHUT-OFF VALVE AND POINT OF BREAK.....	12
FIGURE 5A. SOUTHERN EXPOSURE.....	13
FIGURE 5B. NORTHERN EXPOSURE	13
FIGURE 6. PIPING DIAGRAM FOR THE PROPANE STORAGE AND HANDLING SYSTEM	14
FIGURE 7. AERIAL VIEW OF TANK AREA.....	15
FIGURE 8. FIRE FIGHTERS (NUMBERS) AND RESPONSE VEHICLES (LETTERS) AT THE TIME OF THE BLAST.....	19
FIGURE 9. BLEVE.....	22
FIGURE 10. PIECE OF 18,000-GALLON TANK INSIDE TURKEY BARN (1F)	23
FIGURE 11. DAMAGE TO WEST END OF TURKEY BARN (1F).....	24
FIGURE 12. DAMAGE TO TURKEY BARN (1G) CAUSED BY IMPACT OF LARGE TANK FRAGMENT.....	24
FIGURE 13. SOUTHEASTERN VIEW OF DAMAGE TO WORKSHOP CAUSED BY IMPACT OF LARGE TANK FRAGMENT ...	25